Luther Martin: Genuine Information IV, Baltimore Maryland Gazette, 8 January 1788

It was further said, that in a federal government over States equally free, sovereign and independent, every State ought to have an equal share in making the federal laws or regulations—m. deciding upon them, and in carrying them into execution, neither of which was the case in this system, but the reverse, the States not having an equal voice in the legislature, nor in the appointment of the executive, the judges, and the other officers of government. It was insisted, that in the whole system there was but one federal feature—the appointment of the senators by the States in their sovereign capacity, that is by their legislatures, and the equality of suffrage in that branch; but it was said that this feature was only federal in appearance.

To prove this, and that the Senate as constituted could not be a security for the protection and preservation of the State governments, and that the senators could not be justly considered the representatives of the States as States, it was observed, that upon just principles of representation, the representative ought to speak the sentiments of his constituents, and ought to vote in the same manner that his constituents would do (as far as he can judge) provided his constituents were acting in person, and had the same knowledge and information with himself; and therefore that the representative ought to be dependant on his constituents, and answerable to them—that the connection between the representative and the represented, ought to be as near and as close as possible; according to these principles, Mr. Speaker, in this State it is provided by its constitution, that the representatives in Congress, shall be chosen annually, shall be paid by the State, and shall be subject to recall even within the year; so cautiously has our constitution guarded against an abuse of the trust reposed in our representatives in the federal government; whereas by the third and sixth sections of the first article of this new system, the senators are to be chosen for six years instead of being chosen annually; instead of being paid by their States who send them, they in conjunction with the other branch, are to pay themselves out of the treasury of the United States; and are not liable to be recalled during the period for which they are chosen—Thus, Sir, for six years the senators are rendered totally and absolutely independent of their States, of whom they ought to be the representatives, without any bond or tie between them—During that time they may join in measures ruinous and destructive to their States, even such as should totally annihilate their State governments, and their States cannot recall them, nor exercise any controul over them.

Another consideration, Mr. Speaker, it was thought ought to have great weight to prove that the smaller States cannot depend on the senate for the preservation of their rights, either against large and ambitious States, or against an ambitious, aspiring President. —The senate, Sir, is so constituted, that they are not only to compose one branch of the legislature, but by the second section of the second article, they are to compose a privy council for the President; hence it will he necessary, that they should be, in a great measure, a permanent body, constantly residing at the seat of government. Seventy years is estimated for the life of a man; it can hardly be supposed, that a senator, especially from the States remote from the seat of empire, will accept of an appointment which must estrange him for six years from his State,
without giving up to a great degree his prospects in his own State. If he has a family, he will take his family with him to the place where the government shall be fixed, that will become his home, and there is every reason to expect that his future views and prospects will centre in the favours and emoluments either of the general government, or of the government of that State where the seat of empire is established:—In either case, he is lost to his own State. If he places his future prospects in the favours and emoluments of the general government, he will become the dependant and creature of the President, as the system enables a senator to be appointed to offices, and without the nomination of the President, no appointment can take place; as such, he will favour the wishes of the President, and concur in his measures, who, if he has no ambitious views of his own to gratify, may be too favourable to the ambitious views of the large States, who will have an undue share in his original appointment, and on whom he will be more dependant afterwards than on the States which are smaller. If the senator places his future prospects in that State where the seat of empire is fixed; from that time he will be in every question wherein its particular interest may be concerned the representative of that State, not of his own.