



CENTER FOR THE STUDY OF THE AMERICAN CONSTITUTION

csac.history.wisc.edu > Document Collections > The Creation and Ratification of the Bill of Rights > Amendments Proposed by State Ratifying Conventions

Amendments Proposed by State Ratifying Conventions

Amendments Adopted as the U.S. Bill of Rights

Bill of Rights Guarantees	Pa.	Mass.	Md.	S.C.	N.H.	Va.	N.Y.	N.C.	R.I.	Total number of states
Religious freedom	x		x	x	x	x	x	x	x	8
Free speech	x		x			x		x	x	5
Free press	x		x			x	x	x	x	6
Assembly and petition			x			x	x	x	x	5
Bearing arms	x				x	x	x	x	x	6
Quartering soldiers			x		x	x	x	x	x	6
Searches and seizures	x		x			x	x	x	x	6
Grand jury indictment		x	x		x		x			4
Double jeopardy			x				x			2
Self incrimination	x					x	x	x	x	5
Due process	x		x			x	x	x	x	6
Speedy public trial	x		x			x	x	x	x	6
Cause and nature of accusation	x		x			x	x	x	x	6
Confrontation of accusers & witnesses	x		x			x	x	x	x	6
Counsel	x		x			x	x	x	x	6
Jury trial (civil)	x	x	x		x	x	x	x	x	8
Bail, Fines & Punishment	x					x	x	x	x	5
Rights retained by people	x		x			x	x	x	x	6
Reserved powers	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	9

Amendments Proposed by State Ratifying Conventions

Amendments Not Adopted

Proposed Amendments	Pa.	Mass.	Md.	S.C.	N.H.	Va.	N.Y.	N.C.	R.I.	Total number of states
GENERAL										
Separation of Powers	x					x		x	x	4
Treaties cannot violate federal law or U.S. or state constitutions	x		x				x	x		4
No titles of nobility for U.S. officials from foreign state or king		x			x					2
U.S. officials are trustees and accountable to the people			x			x		x	x	4
Doctrine of non-resistance is absurd			x			x		x		3
No suspension of laws			x			x		x	x	4
No federal poll tax	x		x				x		x	4
No federal excise taxes	x		x				x			3
No standing army in peacetime without consent of super majority of congress	x		x		x	x	x	x	x	7
Military subordinate to civil power	x					x	x	x	x	5
Fish and hunt not prohibited on public lands	x									1
Limits on federal taxes	x		x							2
Elections should be free	x					x		x	x	4
Right of Revolution			x			x	x			3
President, Vice President or members of Congress must be natural-born citizens							x			1
Habeas corpus suspension to be limited							x			1
Amendments to Constitution need ratification by eleven original states									x	1

Amendments Proposed by State Ratifying Conventions

Amendments Not Adopted (continued)

Proposed Amendments	Pa.	Mass.	Md.	S.C.	N.H.	Va.	N.Y.	N.C.	R.I.	Total number of states
Slave trade to Africa must be stopped as soon as possible									x	1
Public offices not to be hereditary						x		x		2
Conscientious objectors exempted from military service			x			x		x	x	4
Enlistment of soldiers limited			x			x		x		3
Federal bankruptcy laws limited							x			1
Federal commissions to be given in name of the people							x			1
Federal laws cannot violate state constitutions or bills or rights			x							1

CONGRESS

No monopolies		x			x		x	x	x	5
No member to hold federal office			x			x	x	x		4
Not to interfere in federal elections	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	9
Restrictions in changing compensation for						x	x	x		3
Rights in Constitution not to extend Congress' powers						x	x	x	x	4
Ex post facto laws apply only to criminal cases							x			1
Congress can introduce foreign troops only by 2/3 vote								x		1
Congress not to interfere with paper money already in circulation								x	x	2
No draft into military									x	1

Amendments Proposed by State Ratifying Conventions

Amendments Not Adopted (continued)

Proposed Amendments	Pa.	Mass.	Md.	S.C.	N.H.	Va.	N.Y.	N.C.	R.I.	Total number of states
Borrowing money requires 2/3 vote of each house							x		x	2
Levy no direct taxes without approval of 3/4 state legislatures									x	1
Declaration of war needs 2/3 vote in each house							x		x	2
Right to give instructions to representatives						x	x	x	x	4
Journals of to be published at least annually						x	x	x	x	4
Appropriations must be published annually						x		x	x	3
Commercial acts need 2/3 approval			x			x		x		3
Congress control over federal capital limited						x	x	x		3
Yeas and Nays must be called on request of two members			x				x		x	3
Doors of both houses be open to public							x			1
Congress can set uniform rule of inhabitancy or settlement of poor in the states									x	1
Congress cannot grant exceptions from emoluments clause						x	x	x	x	4
Congress may give state courts jurisdiction in revenue cases			x							1
Congress should not appropriate funds for military beyond two years			x							1

Amendments Proposed by State Ratifying Conventions

Amendments Not Adopted (continued)

Proposed Amendments	Pa.	Mass.	Md.	S.C.	N.H.	Va.	N.Y.	N.C.	R.I.	Total number of states
SENATE										
Senate not to try impeachments alone						x	x	x		3
Treaties ceding land or fishing and navigation rights need 3/4 approval of Senate						x		x		2
Vacancies in Senate to be filled by state legislatures							x			1
Senate terms limited to 6 years within 12 year period							x			1
Senators can be recalled by states							x		x	2
HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES										
Should be enlarged	x	x			x	x	x	x		6
Annual elections required	x									1
District elections not prohibited							x			1
PRESIDENT										
Pardoning power limited							x			1
Privy council	x		x							2
Election of must be held every four years							x			1
President limited to no more than 8 years within 16 years						x		x		2
President limited to two terms							x			1
President not to take command in field			x				x			2
JUDICIARY										
U.S. Judiciary jurisdiction limited	x	x	x			x	x	x	x	7
No appeal to Supreme Court in criminal cases			x				x			2

Amendments Proposed by State Ratifying Conventions

Amendments Not Adopted (continued)

Proposed Amendments	Pa.	Mass.	Md.	S.C.	N.H.	Va.	N.Y.	N.C.	R.I.	Total number of states
Criminal trials must be in vicinage	x		x			x	x	x	x	6
Evidence can be submitted in criminal cases	x		x			x			x	4
Civil law cases under \$3,000 not appealable to federal courts			x		x					2
Preemptory challenge of jurors guaranteed						x		x		2
Changes in judges' salaries limited						x		x		2
Justice ought to be readily available						x	x	x	x	4
Federal judges not to hold other offices			x				x		x	3
Federal ownership of property does not prohibit state trials in that area							x			1
Creation of federal inferior courts limited			x				x			2
Court of error to be created							x			1
No federal appellate jurisdiction in cases of fact			x			x	x	x		4
No violations of state's sovereign immunity							x		x	2

STATES

Militia limit on out of state activity	x		x				x		x	4
Militia should be under state control	x		x			x	x	x	x	6
Requisitions on must precede direct taxation		x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	8
Federal officials must take oath not to violate state constitutions							x			1
Congress can only declare state in rebellion by 2/3 vote								x		1

Amendments Proposed by State Ratifying Conventions

Amendments Not Adopted (continued)

Proposed Amendments	Pa.	Mass.	Md.	S.C.	N.H.	Va.	N.Y.	N.C.	R.I.	Total number of states
Federal officials must not hold state offices									x	1
Federal duties will be placed in State's quota where raised			x							1
Census to determine proportional taxation		x			x	x	x	x		5

CITE AS: John P. Kaminski et al., eds., *The Documentary History of the Ratification of the Constitution*, Vol. XXXVII: Bill of Rights [1] (Madison, Wis.: Wisconsin Historical Society Press, 2019), 233–40.